

RuyakCherian LLP
1936 University Avenue, Suite 350
Berkeley, CA 94704

1 MICHAEL K. LINDSEY (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
lindsey@gdllawfirm.com

2 JAMES M. SARNECKY (SBN 202465)
sarnecky@gdllawfirm.com

3 GAVRILOVICH, DODD & LINDSEY, LLP
4660 La Jolla Village Dr., Ste. 750

4 San Diego, CA 92122

Telephone: (858) 458-3607

5 Facsimile: (858) 458-9986

6 ROBERT F. RUYAK (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
robertr@ruyakcherian.com

7 BRITTANY V. RUYAK (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
brittanyr@ruyakcherian

8 RONALD R. WIELKOPOLSKI (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)
ronw@ruyakcherian

9 RUYAKCHERIAN, LLP
1776 Eye St. NW, Suite 750

10 Washington, DC 20006

Telephone: (202) 838-1560

11 KORULA T. CHERIAN (SBN 133697)
sunnyc@ruyakcherian.com

12 ROBERT M. HARKINS, JR. (SBN 179525)
13 bobh@ruyakcherian.com

14 RUYAKCHERIAN, LLP
1936 University Ave, Suite 350
Berkeley, CA 94704

15 Telephone: (510) 944-0190

16 Attorneys for Plaintiff
17 CARUCEL INVESTMENTS, L.P.

18 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

19 **SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

20 CARUCEL INVESTMENTS, L.P., a
21 Delaware limited partnership,

22 Plaintiff,

23 v.

24 NOVATEL WIRELESS, INC., a
25 Delaware corporation; VERIZON
26 COMMUNICATIONS INC., a
27 Delaware corporation; and CELLCO
PARTNERSHIP d/b/a VERIZON
WIRELESS,

28 Defendants.

Case No. 16-cv-0118-H-KSC

**PLAINTIFF'S OBJECTIONS TO
DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO RETAX
COSTS**

Judge: Hon. Marilyn L. Huff

RuyakCherian LLP
1936 University Avenue, Suite 350
Berkeley, CA 94704

Plaintiff Carucel Investment, L.P. (“Carucel”) does not object to the evidentiary submission on the motion to retax costs, but maintains the same objection that it made to the \$21,425 Defendants requested for the cost of services of its in-house graphic designer to prepare the graphics and other visual aids used at trial. That amount should not be included as recoverable costs. Recoverable costs are not intended to reimburse for intellectual effort. “Fees for exemplification and copying are permitted only for the physical preparation and duplication of documents, not the intellectual effort involved in their production.” *Zuill v. Shanahan*, 80 F.3d 1366, 1371 (9th Cir. 1996); *see also Duhn Oil Tool, Inc. v. Cameron Int’l Corp.*, No. 1:05-CV-01411-MLH-GSA, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 134199, at *18-19 (E.D. Cal.Sep. 19, 2012); *Romero v. City of Pomona*, 883 F.2d 1418, 1427-28 (9th Cir. 1989); *Oracle Am., Inc. v. Google Inc.*, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 125237, *11 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 4, 2012); *Affymetrix, Inc. v. Multilyte Ltd.*, 2005 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 41177, *12 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 26, 2005). This is the same objection to the same costs originally sought, and Carucel further incorporates by reference the full discussion of why such costs are not reimburseable from its original objections. *See* Dkt. 349.

Dated: October 6, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

RuyakCherian LLP

/s/ Robert Harkins

Robert Harkins

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that all counsel of record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service are being served this 6th day of October, 2017, with a copy of this document via the Court's EM/ECF system. Any other counsel of record will be served by electronic mail, facsimile and/or first class mail on the same date.

/s/ Robert Harkins

Robert Harkins

RuyakCherian LLP
1936 University Ave, Ste 350
Berkeley, CA 94704
Telephone: (510) 944-0190
sunnyc@ruyakcherian.com

RuyakCherian LLP
1936 University Avenue, Suite 350
Berkeley, CA 94704